UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

Marshall E. Bloomfield, Petitioner-Judgment Creditor

Index No: 07 CIV 3934 Hon. Richard Holwell U.S.D.J.

-against-

Dermot MacShane,

Respondent-Judgment Debtor

And

Sergeant's Benevolent Association Annuity Fund, The City of New York Police Pension Fund, and the Fund Office of Local 580 of Architectural and Ornamental Iron Workers,

----X

Respondents.

Colleran, O'Hara & Mills LLP Attorneys for Respondent Local 580 of Architectural and Ornamental Iron Workers 1225 Franklin Ave STE 450 Garden City NY 11530 516-248-5757 To:

O'Dwyer & Bernstein LLP Attorneys for Respondent Sergeant's Benevolent Association Annuity Fund 52 Duane ST 5FL New York NY 10007

Dermot MacShane Judgment Debtor-Respondent Pro Se 1030 Hollywood Ave Bronx NY 10463

Dermot MacShane Judgment Debtor-Respondent Pro Se 72 Rockledge RD APT M Hartsdale, NY 10530

Corporation Counsel for the City of New York Attorneys for The City of New York Police Pension Fund 100 Church ST New York NY 10007

MEMORANDUM OF LAW

Petitioner-Judgment-Creditor/Movant submits this Memorandum in support of its Notice of Motion to Remand the instant matter to New York State Supreme Court Putnam County. This action was improperly removed from Putnam County because it is an action involving, in part, a Domestic Relations Order originating in Putnam County.

FACTS

This is petition to enforce a decision issued in a the matrimonial action of MacShane v. MacShane. The action was commenced in the Supreme Court of the State of New York County of Putnam under index number 1798/2002. During court proceedings in Putnam County, Justice Fred L. Shapiro, issued a domestic relations order from the bench wherein he held on the record, "there will be no distribution of any assets to Mr. MacShane without you [Mr. Bloomfield] being heard, and it would be my intention to give you your fee off the top of any distribution [emphasis supplied]. "See, "Exhibit B" of the Accompanying Bloomfield Affidavit. Included in any distribution were funds held by the respondents hereto.

Petitioner, believing that a distribution occurred in the matrimonial action sought equitable relief from the Putnam County State Court to enforce the above referenced order. Subsequent thereto, Respondent the Fund Office of Local 580 of Architectural and Ornamental Iron Workers, without notice to petitioner, removed this matter to the Southern District of New York. The facts of this matter are fully set forth in the underlying papers and in the accompanying Affidavit of Petitioner Marshall E. Bloomfield.

ARGUMENT

State Courts Remain the Best Venue to Hear Matrimonial Actions

As Judge Harold Baer, Jr. of this Court recognized in Anonymous v. Anonymous, 2001 U.S. Dist. Lexis 20928 (S.D.N.Y 2001), "[i]t has long been the practice of federal courts to

discourage adjudication of domestic relations disputes in federal courts."

In the case remanded herein, Mr. Bloomfield's lien and judgment are the product of a domestic relations order made by the Supreme Court of the State of New York County of Putnam in the underlying matrimonial action.

While it is true that Mr. Bloomfield's action seeks recovery of his attorney's fees for services rendered to Mr. MacShane, and there may be an issue as to whether attorney's fees may be collected from a pension through a Qualified Domestic Relations Order ["QDRO"], as this Court cannot issue or modify a QDRO, Mr. Bloomfield would be barred from receiving any relief in this venue. See, Ankenbrandt v. Richards, 504 U.S. 689,703; Anonymous v. Anonymous, 2001 U.S. Dist. Lexis 20928; Hunter v. Ameritech, 779 F. Supp. 419, 421 (N.D. Ill. 1991); Jones v. American Airlines, Inc., 571 F. Supp. 2d. 1224, 1232 (D. Wyo. 1999).

As Judge Baer concluded in <u>Anonymous v. Anonymous</u>, 2001 U.S. Dist. Lexis 20928, where the relief sought by the movant therein was either a declatory judgment as to whether attorney's fees could be awarded in a QDRO, or a modification of the QDRO, the Southern District of New York "lacks subject matter jurisdiction over the action."

Accordingly, this court should abide by Judge Baer's prior holding in <u>Anonymous v. Anonymous</u>, 2001 U.S. Dist. Lexis 20928.

CONCLUSION

As Mr. Bloomfield is seeking equitable relief with respect to a domestic relations order, this Court lacks jurisdiction to hear his proceeding that seeks enforcement relative to an underlying domestic relations order.

Thus, this matter should be remanded to the Supreme Court of the State of New York, County of Putnam.

June 25, 2007 Dated:

Bronx, New York

Yours, etc.,

Marshall E./Momfield, Esq. Petitioner/Magment Creditor/Movant 349 E 149/87

BX NY /1/0451-5603

(718) 665-5900 <> (212) 662-1870

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK	ndex No: 07 CIV 3934
Marshall E. Bloomfield,	Hon. Richard J. Holwell U.S.D.J.
Petitioner-Judgment Creditor -against- Dermot MacShane, Respondent-Judgment	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE
Debtor And Sergeant's Benevolent Association	
Annuity Fund, The City of New York Police Pension Fund, and the Fund Office of Local 580 of Architectural and Ornamental Iron Workers, Respondents.	
x	
STATE OF NEW YORK)	
COUNTY OF THE BRONX)	
William J. Knoesel, being duly swor 1) Deponent is not a party to years of age and resides within the	the action, is over 18

2) That on the 26th day of June, 2007, Deponent served the within and attached document(s); Notice of Motion for Remand and Supporting Papers, and a Memorandum of Law upon:

Colleran, O'Hara & Mills LLP Attorneys for Respondent Local 580 of Architectural and Ornamental Iron Workers 1225 Franklin Ave STE 450 Garden City NY 11530	O'Dwyer & Bernstein LLP Attorneys for Respondent Sergeant's Benevolent Association Annuity Fund 52 Duane ST 5FL New York NY 10007	Dermot MacShane Judgment Debtor-Respondent Pro Se 1030 Hollywood Ave Bronx NY 10463
Corporation Counsel for the City of New York Attorneys for The City of New York Police Pension Fund 100 Church ST New York NY 10007	Dermot MacShane Judgmen; Debtor-Respondent Pro Se 72 Rockledge RD APT M Hartsdale, NY 10530	

said address(es) having been designated (by said Attorney[s]) for that purpose, by depositing a true copy(ies) of same enclosed in a postpaid properly addressed wrapper(s), First Class Mail,, in a post office official depository under the exclusive care and cystody of the United States Postal Service within New York State

Khoesel

Sworn to before 2 gth June

NOTARY PUBLIC MARSHALL E LOOMFIE

Notary Purity State of New York No. 02BL03#6550 Qualified in the County of The Bronx Commission Expires June 30, 2011

Law Offices of: MARSHALL E. BLOOMFIELD, ESQ. • 349 East 149th St., BX, NY 10451-5603 • (718) 665-5900 or (212) 662-1870

Index No: 07 CIV 3934
Hon. Richard J. Holwell U.S.D.J.
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

Marshall E. Bloomfield, Petitioner-Judgment Creditor

> -against-Dermot MacShane,

Respondent-Judgment Debtor

And

Sergeant's Benevolent Association Annuity Fund, The City of New York Police Pension Fund, and the Fund Office of Local 580 of Architectural and Ornamental Iron Workers,

Respondents.

MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF PETITIONER-JUDGMENT CREDITOR'S NOTICE OF MOTION TO REMAND

To: Colleran, O'Hara & Mills LLP
Attorneys for Respondent Local 580 of
Architectural and Ornamental Iron Workers
1225 Franklin Ave STE 450
Garden City NY 11530
516-248-5757

O'Dwyer & Bernstein LLP Attorneys for Respondent Sergeant's Benevolent Association Annuity Fund 52 Duane ST 5FL New York NY 10007

Dermot MacShane
Judgment Debtor-Respondent Pro Se
1030 Hollywood Ave
Bronx NY 10463

Dermot MacShane Judgment Debtor-Respondent Pro Se 72 Rockledge RD APT M Hartsdale, NY 10530

Corporation Counsel for the City of New York Attorneys for The City of New York Police Pension Fund 100 Church ST New York NY 10007